

**博士論文審査結果報告**  
Report on Ph. D. / Doctoral Dissertation Defense

政策研究大学院大学  
教授 MUNRO, Alistair

審査委員会を代表し、以下のとおり審査結果を報告します。

On behalf of the Degree Committee, I would like to report the result of the Ph. D. / Doctoral Dissertation Defense as follows.

1. 学位申請者氏名 Ph. D. Candidate	Rima Prama Artha					
2. 学籍番号 ID Number	PHD09016					
3. プログラム名 Program	政策分析プログラム Policy Analysis Program					
4. 審査委員会 Degree Committee	主査 Main Referee	MUNRO, Alistair	主指導教員 Main Advisor			
	審査委員 Referee	山内 慎子 YAMAUCHI, Chikako	副指導教員 Sub Advisor			
	審査委員 Referee	ESTUDILLO Jonna P.	副指導教員 Sub Advisor			
	審査委員 Referee	園部 哲史 SONOBE, Tetsushi	博士課程委員会委員長 Chairperson of the Ph. D/Doctoral Programs Committee			
	審査委員 Referee	高橋 和志 (アジア経済研究所) TAKAHASHI, Kazushi (Institute of Developing Economies)	外部審査員 Referee from Outside Institutions			
5. 論文タイトル Dissertation Title	Essays on Unintended Impacts of Two Cash Transfer Interventions in Indonesia					
6. 論文提出日 Submission Date of the Draft Dissertation	平成27(2015)年7月30日					
7. 論文発表会開催日 Date of the Defense	平成27(2015)年8月27日					
8. 論文審査会開催日 Date of the Degree Committee Meeting	平成27(2015)年8月27日					
9. 論文最終版提出日 submission date of the Final Dissertation	平成27(2015)年10月6日					
10. 学位名 Degree Title	博士(開発経済学) Ph.D. in Development Economics					
11. 審査結果 Result	<table style="margin: auto;"> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">合格 Pass</td> <td style="text-align: center;">/</td> <td style="text-align: center;">不合格 failure</td> </tr> </table>			合格 Pass	/	不合格 failure
合格 Pass	/	不合格 failure				

※タイトルが英文の場合、文部科学省に報告するため、和訳を付してください  
If the title is in English, please translate in Japanese in order to report MEXT.

## I. 論文要旨

### Thesis overview and summary of the presentation

Conditional cash programs are policies where target individuals or communities receive cash to alleviate poverty in return for following certain rules. For instance, a policy might pay the cash to the household provided the children attend school regularly or get regular health checks. In Indonesia two cash transfer programs were piloted in 2007, one targeted at households and one at communities. The issue of whether these policies met their intended objectives has been intensively analysed using data collected by the World Bank. However new policies can have unintended impacts that may be positive or negative. For instance projects that provide financial support to a poor community may replace local mutual assistance or promote disharmony if the policy is poorly targeted. Similarly policies that provide women with cash for ensuring their children meet health and education goals may reinforce traditional roles for women and undermine their autonomy. This thesis therefore examines the extent to which the Indonesian programs

Structurally the thesis consists of five parts. The first chapter provides a broad introduction; the second chapter analyses the impact of the Program Keluarga Harapan (PKH) impact on local disharmony and conflicts. The results show that generally the program did not generate any local disharmony as measured by the following indicators: mutual assistance participation, contribution and communal decision-making process, as well as violent and communal conflict in the community. However, in the presence of ethnic diversity, she finds some evidence that program implementation generated both disharmony and conflict in community.

The third chapter investigates the impact of a hybrid program that combines community driven development program and conditional cash transfer program, which gives a block grant to communities, on the local leader and household relationship quality, especially the poorest ones. The relationship quality is quite difficult to measure but here it is represented by how closely households know their five different levels of local leaders. Her finding shows no effect of community CCT on household-leaders closeness, for both the overall sample and the poorest households. She also finds that the program -especially the one with an incentive - improved the relationship quality between the poor with all types local leaders.

Chapter Four examines the effect of the CCT programs on women's autonomy and their participation in family planning, health and education counseling. The results suggested that both programs positively increased women's autonomy in their freedom to buy. However, the indicator on intra-household decision making power was significantly decreased after the implementation of community intervention.

Chapter Five concludes the dissertation and consists of a summary of the main results, combined with some suggested policy changes. The main lesson is that in general there were no strong, negative impacts from the conditional cash programs. However, in the presence of ethnic diversity, some impacts can be negative.

After an opening address by Professor Sonobe, the candidate presented her thesis for approximately one hour. Questions from the referees followed and then remarks and questions from other members of the audience. The committee retired to another room to discuss the presentation and the dissertation.

## II. 審查報告

### Notes from the Degree Committee (including changes required to the thesis by the referees)

The referees unanimously agreed that the dissertation was worthy of a pass, but nevertheless they had a number of significant concerns and suggestions for improvements. Most notably, they commented on the poor quality of the written English. In places it was just not possible to understand what the candidate was trying to say. There were also omissions from the list of references.

Detailed written comments were received from three of the referees that mostly covered suggestions for further robustness checks, clarification of methods and the program implementation. Some, specific advice and comments included,

1. Revising the jargon to reflect practices in the program evaluation literature.
2. Re-checking the propensity score estimates where some of the coefficients are identical even though different methods are used.
3. More background on the programs, the scale of their financial impact and their scope and the randomization methods used in the pilot.
4. Providing data on the accuracy of the targeting of the programs.
5. Being clearer about where the thesis is original and where it is not.
6. Examining whether some of the apparent results are due to baseline differences between treated and untreated communities.
7. Lack of a clear empirical basis for some policy suggestions.

The referees agreed that the supervision of the changes and the tasks of checking their acceptability should be delegated to the main referee.

## III. 最終提出論文確認結果

### Confirmation by the Main Referee that changes have been done to the satisfaction of the referees

The task of checking was delegated to the main referee. Rima received written comments from the three members of the committee. She revised the thesis in line with these comments and provided an item-by-item list of changes to me. I was satisfied by the changes to the content and then approved commercial copy-editing of the dissertation to correct the remaining English mistakes. Having gone through the corrected dissertation, I am satisfied of its quality.

## IV. 最終審查結果

### Final Recommendation

Pass