

博士論文審査結果報告
Report on Ph.D. / Doctoral Dissertation Defense
 National Graduate Institute for Policy Studies
 教授 園部 哲史

審査委員会を代表し、以下のとおり審査結果を報告します。

On behalf of the Doctoral Thesis Review Committee, I would like to report the result of the Doctoral Dissertation Defense as follows.

学位申請者氏名 Ph.D. Candidate	Edwin Paul Mhede		
学籍番号 ID Number	DOC13161		
プログラム名 Program	State Building and Economic Development Program		
審査委員会 Doctoral Thesis Review Committee	主査 Main referee	園部 哲史 Tetsushi Sonobe	主指導教員 Main Advisor
	審査委員 Referee	木島 陽子 Yoko Kijima	副指導教員 Sub Advisor
	審査委員 Referee	飯尾 潤 Iio Jun	博士課程委員会委員長代理 Acting Chairperson of the Doctoral Programs Committee
	審査委員 Referee	高橋 和志 Takahashi Kazushi 上智大学 経済学部・経済 学科	外部審査委員 External Referee
論文タイトル Dissertation Title (タイトル和訳)※ Title in Japanese	Toward Productivity Improvement in Private Firms and Public Offices: Case Studies in Tanzania 私企業と官公庁の生産性向上へ向けて：タンザニアにおける事例研究		
学位名 Degree Title	博士（国際開発研究）Ph.D. in International Development Studies		
論文提出日 Submission Date of the Draft Dissertation	2018年1月17日	論文審査会開催日 Date of the Doctoral Thesis Review Committee	2018年2月14日
論文発表会開催日 Date of the Defense	2018年2月14日	論文最終版提出日 Submission Date of the Final Dissertation	2018年8月22日
審査結果 Result	合格 Pass		

※タイトルが英文の場合、文部科学省に報告するため、和訳を付してください

Please add a Japanese title that will be reported to MEXT.

1. 論文要旨 **Thesis overview and summary of the presentation.**

In recent years, there has been increasing interest in business management among economists. They have attempted to measure management practices, relate them to the level and growth rate of productivity at the firm level, and explore the implications of their findings for policies related to financial market, economic development, and so on. These attempts include a number of randomized controlled trials (RCTs) of management training that are intended to assess the impact of management practice improvements on business performance as well as to test the hypothesis that management can be taught to managers. Still many issues on management remain open.

This dissertation aims to address two questions that remain open in this recent literature. One is the question of why the existing studies of management training have obtained mixed results with respect to the impact of short-term training programs for small-scale enterprises on their business performance. To address this question, the dissertation uses the experimental data generated by the GRIPS-World Bank Joint Research Project that was conducted in 2010 – 2013. The project involved an RCT that provided a short-term training program for garment producers in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. The dissertation also uses follow-up survey data collected by a GRIPS research team after the joint project. While the existing studies involving similar RCTs are based on follow-up observations for just one year after training, the dissertation uses follow-up survey data that cover nearly four years after training. Taking this advantage, it finds that the training program had a significant effect on business performance of training participants. The finding lends support to the hypothesis that the mixed results of the existing studies are at least partially attributed to premature observation.

The second question addressed by the dissertation concerns management in public offices. As is well known, it is difficult to measure the performance of public offices. This difficulty translates into the difficulty in determining whether management is good or bad in a particular office. For example, those officers who work seemingly inefficiently might plan a good policy. Empirical studies of public office management are naturally fewer in number than those of private business management. The dissertation, however, points out that poor management in particular offices can be sometimes almost evident without referring to the offices' performance. To demonstrate this point, the author of the dissertation (that is, the candidate) made personal interviews with 46 office managers and 125 office workers under the managers in public offices in Dar es Salaam and the adjacent city. The dissertation reports that the vast majority of the workers and about a half of the managers failed to describe their missions and targets. Without knowing targets, it is hard to achieve them. The dissertation also finds that communications between managers and workers and among workers are infrequent and inefficient even though they spend much time chatting with each other. That is, the management practices that maintain a high quality of communications are missing in public offices.

The dissertation consists of five chapters. It reviews the economic literature on management and the literature on public administration in Chapter 2. The results of econometric analysis of the data of garment producers are discussed in Chapter 3. The data on the ignorance of missions and targets of public officers as well as their poor communications are descriptively analyzed in Chapter 4. The major findings of the two case studies are summarized and their policy implications are briefly discussed in Chapter 5.

2. 審查報告 Notes from the Doctoral Thesis Review Committee (including changes required to the thesis by the referees)

The final presentation was followed by vigorous questioning by the members of the doctoral thesis review committee except for the main referee, who served as the facilitator. The members had prepared written comments, which were collected after the final examination by the main referee and sent to the candidate.

All the questions came from the ambiguity of descriptions in the dissertation. All the committee members complained of the redundancy and ambiguity of descriptions, unnecessarily many and large tables reporting unimportant information, and the complicated system of numbering sub-sections and sub-sub-sections.

Comments were concentrated on three issues. One was that Chapter 3 reported only the medium-run impact of the training program on trained producers without reporting shorter-run impacts. The committee pointed out that the dissertation should have fully used all the available data to describe the changes over time in the impact of the training program.

The second issue on which comments were concentrated was the treatment of knowledge spillovers in Chapter 3. The data set has some interesting variables capturing the spread of the knowledge that training participants acquired from the training program to their friends who did not participate in the program. The dissertation showed the results of regressions that included these variables, but the variables are obviously endogenous to the dependent variable. The committee recommended that the discussions of these regressions are either placed in an appendix or replaced, if possible,

by the rigorous analysis of knowledge spillovers that applies a recently developed methodology.

The third comment was about Chapter 4. The purpose of this chapter is to point out a symptom of a possibly important problem in public office without going into the analysis of the cause of pathway. The chapter's argument should be straightforward and brief, but it was not. The committee urged the candidate to shorten and sharpen the argument.

After several months, the candidate submitted a revised version, which was immediately circulated to the committee members. In this version, the tables and numbering are much simpler, and the number of pages is much smaller. Chapter 3 traces changes in the training effect on garment producers by using all the data. The revised version does not include a new analysis of knowledge spillovers because the candidate found that the new methodology did not work well on his data largely because of the small sample size. Instead it places the discussion of knowledge spillovers in an appendix. After a few weeks, the committee members agreed to left entirely up to the final check and decision by the main referee.

3. 最終提出論文確認結果 Confirmation by the Main Referee that changes have been done to the satisfaction of the referees

The main referee carefully read the revised version and instructed the candidate to make further revisions, especially to reduce remaining redundancy. The new version of the dissertation was submitted early August 2018, but the main referee recommended that the title of the dissertation should be changed from *Inquiries into Productivity Improvement in Private Firms and Public Offices: Evidence from Tanzania* into *Toward*

Productivity Improvement in Private Firms and Public Offices: Case Studies in Tanzania because the latter represents the content of the dissertation better. As the candidate changed the title accordingly, the main referee finds that revisions have been made to the satisfaction of the dissertation committee.

4. 最終審査結果 **Final recommendation**

The doctoral thesis review committee recommends that GRIPS award the degree of Ph.D. in International Development Studies to Mr. Edwin Paul Mhede.